THE COLLEGIUM MUSICUM STRUGGLES AGAINST THE TIDE:

A Brief Survey of Dissent Against the Established Order



John Lilburne, leader of the democratic "Leveller" movement, shown behind bars in 1646 for his dissension.

He that wrestles with us strengthens our nerves and sharpens our skill.

Our antagonist is our help.

(Edmund Burke)

FAIRCHILD CHAPEL

1988 4:30 P.M.

SATURDAY, APRIL 30

Current events in South Africa, Israel, Afghanistan, El Salvador, India, Panama and Soviet Armenia have reconfirmed, as history repeatedly has, that if dissent is unheeded or suppressed by the established order it can flare into defiance. If that defiance is further repressed, open rebellion and massive bloodshed are the most frequent results. Music has consistently provided an impetus and a rallying point for mass dissent as a wealth of protest songs over the centuries attests. Within our own memory, the power of Pete Seeger's protests against the Vietnam involvement, and the continuing influence of We shall overcome as the symbol of the struggle of oppressed Blacks and other minorities constitute two of many possible examples. We will endeavor to explore some of the roles music has shared over the centuries in expressing the convictions and emotions of various dissidents. Some efforts were covert and deliberately ambiguous; others, overt and openly defiant. Collectively, they provide insights into history that remain relevant to dissent and protest in our own time.

FOREWORD:

LEARNED HAND, late Judge of Federal Circuit Court of Appeals:

Ben Saferstein, reader

NEW YORK TIMES, March 13, 1988:

David Nowacek, reader

I. VARIETIES OF NON-CONFORMITY

Conform and be dull!
(James Frank Dobie)

Who would be a man must be a non-conformist.

(Ralph Waldo Emerson)

PROCESSIONAL: AN INITIAL WARNING TO DISSENTERS:

A warning to false Traitors, by example of fourteen; whereof six were executed in divers places neere about London, and two in Braintford, the 28th day of August, 1588; also at Tyborne were executed six; viz., five men and one woman: to the tune of GREENSLEEVES.

(Document in Society of Antiquaries)

You traitors all

Hanging Song at time of Elizabeth I

COLLEGIUM

THE DOUBLE MEANING:

Byrd's wife had been cited for recusancy, and the composer's house was listed as a suspected recusant gathering-place. Later his house was twice searched and Byrd was fined for recusancy. The Catholics in England were accustomed to having their plight under Elizabeth likened to that of the captive children of Israel, and England symbolized as a ravaged Jerusalem.

Civitas sancti tui

William Byrd (1543-1623)

Thy holy city is made a wilderness. Zion is made a wilderness. Jerusalem is a desolation. (Isaiah 64, 10)

CHORUS

Father Edmund Campion was executed in 1581 for preaching a sermon comparing the sorry state of biblical Jerusalem to that of Elizabeth's England without papal authority. His martyrdom elicited a well-known poem that has been attributed to Henry Walpole. Campion's quartered body and those of his companions were nailed to a gate on Tyburn Hill where portions were stolen by the faithful to be preserved as holy relics. The printing of the poem cost the publisher his two ears. Another person came under suspicion later on simply for copying it. Byrd's intention in setting of several of the less controversial verses could not have been mistaken or gone unnoticed.

Why do I use my paper, ink, and pen

William Byrd

Why do I use my paper, ink, and pen, And call my wits to counsel what to say? Such memories were made for mortal men, I speak of saints whose names cannot decay. An angel's trump were fitter for to sound Their glorious death, if such on earth were found. (Attributed to Henry Walpole)

Michèle Moede, soprano
INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

ARTFUL AMBIGUITY:

DESIDERIUS ERASMUS, In Praise of Folly:

Rachel Clapham, reader

THE SECRET CHROMATIC ART:

If the Flemish Waelrant was not a true Anti-Baptist, he must have had sympathy for their cause. Edwin Lowinsky believed that these convictions were highlighted in the motet, *Venit fortion*, by some striking secret chromaticism which emphasizes words proclaiming the Lord's power to baptize with the Holy Ghost in contrast to John's baptism with water. This secret chromatic device, Lowinsky believed, paralleled similar techniques in literature by which writers, such as Erasmus, could still convey their strong personal beliefs in spite of the intense scrutiny of the Church and State.

Venit fortior post me

Hubert Waelrant (1517-1595)

There cometh one mightier after me, for whom I am not worthy to stoop down and unloose his shoes. I have baptized you with water, but HE WILL BAPTIZE YOU WITH THE HOLY GHOST. And it came to pass in those days, that Jesus came from Nazareth in Galilee, and was baptized of John in the Jordan.

(Mark 1, 7-9)

CHORUS

THE DEFIANT REFORMER:

A Jesuit contemporary testified that "the hymns of Luther have killed more souls than his sermons."

Ein feste Burg

Johann Kugelmann (fl. 1540)

THE BATTLE HYMN OF THE REFORMATION: [A mighty fortress is our God, a good defense and bulwark. He helps free us from all need which has now confounded us. The ancient evil enemy with earnestness who now purposes (to do us woe); great power and much cunning are his dreadful weapons; on earth there is not his equal.]

(Martin Luther's German paraphrase of Psalm XLVI)

SACKBUT TRIO

A DEFIANT CALVINIST:

Goudimel's conversion to Calvinism resulted in his death in the St. Bartholomew Massacre of 1572. He published four-part settings in 1564 and 1565 of all 150 psalm tunes from the Genevan Psalter, after psalm singing had been banned by the French monarchy. Psalm LXVIII became the rousing battle hymn for the Huguenots. The melody was earlier composed by Matthias Greitter and was first set to Psalm CXIX in the Strassburg Psalter of 1525.

Que Dieu se monstre seulement

Claude Goudimel (c. 1510-1572)

BATTLE SONG OF THE HUGUENOTS: Let God arise, let his enemies be scattered: let them also that hate him flee before him. As smoke is driven away, so drive them away: as wax melteth before the fire, so let the wicked perish at the presence of God. (Psalm LXVIII, French version of Thèodore de Bèze)

Suzanne Metz, soprano

RECORDER CONSORT

II. CONFORMITY: AN ALTERNATIVE

There's just one rule for politicians all over the world: Don't say in Power what you say in Opposition; if you do, you only have to carry out what the other fellows have found impossible.

(John Galsworthy, Maid in Waiting)

CONFORMITY OF TWO LOVERS:

THOMAS HARDY, The Conformers:

Ellen Bradburn, reader

THE ECCLESIASTICAL CHAMELEON:

The Vicar of Bray in Berkshire from 1540-1588 was a Papist under the reign of Henry VIII, and a Protestant under Edward VI. "He was a Papist again under Mary, and once again became a Protestant in the reign of Elizabeth. When this scandal to the gown was reproached for his versatility of religious creeds, and taxed for being a turncoat and an inconstant changeling, he replied, 'Not so, I'm neither; for if I changed my religion, I kept true to my principle; which is, to live and die the Vicar of Bray." The Vicar in our ballad is a fictional successor of similar inconstancy, who survives the reigns from Charles II to George I.

The Vicar of Bray

Ballad from the time of George I

(1714-1727)

Daniel Judge, baritone

MEN'S CHORUS

TRIDENTINE CONFORMITY:

The composer Ruffo completely refashioned his original polyphonic, imitative style to conform to the stringent dictates of the Council of Trent. His late works were completely syllabic and homophonic to permit all the words to be heard and clearly understood.

Gloria Fragment

Vincenzo Ruffo (1510-c. 1587)

NEWLY COMPOSED ACCORDING TO THE FORM OF THE COUNCIL OF TRENT:

Glory to God in the highest, and on earth, peace to men of good will. We praise thee; we bless thee; we adore thee; we glorify thee. We give thee thanks for thy great glory, O Lord God, heavenly king, God the father Almighty. O Lord Jesus Christ, the only begotten Son of the Father, Lamb of God, Son of the Father.

CHORUS

There is a limit at which forbearance ceases to be a virtue . . .

The only thing necessary for the triumph of evil

is for good men to do nothing.

(Edmund Burke)

QUESTIONABLE FORBEARANCE:

ABRAHAM LINCOLN, Letter to Joshua F. Speed:

Peter Goehring, reader

MARTIN NIEMOELLER (attributed):

Howard Leder, reader

PURIFICATION OF INTENT:

A "purified" religious text was substituted by Di Lasso's sons after their father's death to replace that initially set by the composer in this remarkable chromatic motet. The original words were addressed to an Anna, not Christ.

Christe, Dei soboles

Orlando di Lasso (1532-1594)

Christ, Son of God, hope and my sole joy, nectar drips from Thy mouth as liquor. Behold, for Thee I raise a modest gift willingly at the altar. Nothing in all the earth is more dear to me than Thou.

Suzanne Metz, Catherine Aragon, sopranos David Nowacek, tenor Carlo Maley, bass

III. BALLAD-MAKERS AND THE COMMONWEALTH

In 1642, ballads citing "the great deeds of Oliver Cromwell" were seriously proposed to Parliament to be sung at Christmas time in place of Christmas carols. But by 1648, when Charles I was in prison, the newly appointed Provost-Martial was empowered "to seize upon all ballad-singers, and to suppress stage plays." Clearly by this time no further ballads were being written in favor of the Commonwealth, and Royalist songs were being printed secretly. The first to openly champion the royal cause was John Cleveland. He was twice arrested and imprisoned, but subsequently released in spite of his vitriol against Cromwell.

"What's a Protector? He's a stately thing,
That apes it in the nonage of a king
A tragic actor—Caesar is a clown;
He's a brass farthing stamped with a crown;
A bladder blown, with other breath puff'd full;
Aesop's proud ass veil'd in the lion's skin;
An outward saint lin'd with a devil within . . .
(John Cleveland, fellow of St. John's College, Cambridge)

THE LAWYERS' LAMENTATION FOR CHARING CROSS:

Charing Cross was the final and most exquisite of the twelve memorial crosses erected by Edward I in 1291 to mark the route from Harby in Nottinghamshire to the final resting place in Westminster Abbey of his queen, Eleanor. The original cross was destroyed by the Puritans and the Rump Parliament in 1647.

Prince Rupert was the nephew of Charles I. He learned the more brutal methods of continental warfare in the Thirty Years' War. He commanded the Royalists in their first major, but indecisive, battle at Edgehill in 1642.

BALLAD: Undone, undone, the lawyers cry

Tune of Prince Rupert's March

Suzanne Metz, Catherine Aragon, sopranos Kirsten Hagstrom, Margaret Moore, mezzo-sopranos Paul Patanella, Peter Goehring, baritones Daniel Judge, Carlo Maley, basses

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

THE FRENCH CONNECTION:

Charles I married Henrietta Maria, sister of Louis XIII of France. During the turmoil of 1646, their son Charles fled to France where he remained with his mother. After his father was beheaded in 1649, he returned to Scotland, where he was proclaimed and crowned Charles II. After suffering a resounding defeat by Cromwell, he escaped in disguise and returned again to France where he remained in exile at the court of Louis XIV until the Restoration in 1660.

BALLAD: The French Report

c. 1646

Jennifer Love, Jennifer Kiernan; Jennifer Baker, Katrina Grieve; Kirsten Hagstrom, Heather Parker; Catherine Aragon, Margaret Moore, soloists

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

BALLAD: Vive le Roy

Greg Bloy, Mike Gallager, David Nowacek, tenors Peter Goehring, Tom Hallenbeck, Howard Leder, baritones Carlo Maley, Alex Wolf, basses

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

IV. DEFIANCE OF CAESAR

The melody adapted for *O Mensch, bewein* is again that of Matthias Greitter which, in the Genevan Psalter, would carry the text of Psalm LXVIII—the battle song of the Huguenots.

O Mensch, bewein dein' Sünde gross

Kaspar Othmayr

(1515-1553)

[O man, bemoan your grievious sin; your Christ left His Father's throne and came to earth. From a maiden pure and sweet He was born here for us; He would become our Redeemer. He gave the dead Life and banished all illness, until the time came that He was sacrificed for us, bearing the heavy burden of our sins willingly on the Cross.] (Sebald Heyden)

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

THE CONSPIRACY:

From MATTHEW XXVI, 3-5:

Heather Parker, reader

Gesualdo's remarkable settings of texts drawn from the liturgy for Holy Week and the Passion openly defy the much more limited harmonic traditions of his time. They seem an extremely appropriate medium to portray Christ's last hours where He maintained that His kingdom was not of this world and that His kingly authority came from elsewhere, in defiance of the law that there could be no king but Caesar.

Seniores populi consilium

Don Carlo Gesualdo di Venosa

(c. 1560-1613)

The Elders of the people consulted together: How they might by stealth apprehend Jesus and slay Him: with swords and clubs they went forth as to a thief.

(Responsory IX for Thursday in Holy Week)

Jennifer Baker, Kirsten Hagstrom, sopranos Jennifer Kiernan, alto Ben Saferstein, bass

CHORUS

THE APPREHENSION:

From MATTHEW XXVI, 47, 55, 56:

From JOHN XIX, 12-15:

Carlo Maley, Jennifer Baker, readers

Distler, a brilliant young German composer, apparently unable to bear the severity of the Nazi oppression, took his own life in 1942.

O Mensch, bewein dein' Sunde gross

Hugo Distler (1908-1942)

SACKBUT TRIO

THE CRUCIFIXION:

From MATTHEW XXVII, 35-37, 39, 41, 44:

Jennifer Love, reader

O vos omnes

Gesualdo

O all of you who pass by this way, behold and see if there is any sorrow like unto my sorrow.

(Lamentations I, 12)

Ecce vidimus eum

Gesualdo

Lo, we have seen Him without comeliness or beauty: His look is gone from Him: He hath borne our sins and suffered for us: He was wounded for our iniquities.

(Responsory III for Thursday of Holy Week)

CHORUS

V. THE AGE WE LIVE IN

There is no week nor day when tyranny may not enter this country, if people lose their supreme confidence in themselves and lose their roughness and spirit of DEFIANCE!

(Walt Whitman)

DEFIANCE OF THE SPACE AND NUCLEAR AGE:

ROBERT FROST, Some Science Fiction:

Paul V. Patanella, reader

A record 1000 anti-nuclear protesters were arrested yesterday at the nation's nuclear testing grounds in Mercury, Nevada... The crowd cheered as each group of protesters stepped across the guard. The actress Terri Garr was asked if she thought joining the protest would hurt her movie career. "I hope not," she said. "I don't think you have to be a fanatic to think nuclear weapons are going to annihilate the Earth."

(Wire Reports, March 13, 1988)

ARCHIBALD MACLEISH, The End of the World:

Katrina Grieve, reader

A STRANGE ALLIANCE:

It is curious that Hindemith, who left Nazi Germany to become an American citizen mainly because of Hitler's oppression of the Jews, should have chosen poetry of Weinheber for the cycle of twelve madrigals that comprises one of his last and most significant choral works. Early on, the poet wrote heroic odes lauding the Third Reich. *Mitwelt*, however, suggests a growing disillusionment with contemporaries that may have culminated in Weinheber's apparent suicide in 1943.

MADRIGAL: Mitwelt [Our Contemporaries]

Paul Hindemith (1895-1963)

Better than an endless string of lukewarm friends is a single foe with [a sense of] honor. It is bitter to digest a busybody's preaching, and difficult to digest the fame of the expert. You may stoutly want to do the right thing should any kind of harlot happen to cross your path. Yet I would rather die than have that horror of a helper's half-baked action—O, if only it would have been left undone!—claiming my thanks for disgrace and my trust for murder.

(Josef Weinheber)

CHORUS

CENTRAL AMERICAN POLICY:

The voice of protest, of warning, of appeal is never more needed than when the clamor of fife of drum, echoed by the press and too often by the pulpit, is bidding all men fall in and keep step and obey in silence the tyrannous word of command. Then, more than ever, it is the duty of the good citizen not to be silent.

(Charles Eliot Norton, True Patriotism)

RAYMOND TANTER, former member of Reagan's National Security Council and currently a Professor at the University of Michigan, Who is at the Helm?:

Tom Hallenbeck, reader

ASSOCIATED PRESS, January 27, 1988:

Catherine Aragon, reader

ASSOCIATED PRESS, March 19, 1988:

Jennifer Kiernan, reader

Domine, libera animam meam

Psalm Tone II

O Lord, deliver my soul from the lying lip, and from the treacherous tongue. What shall be given unto you, or what shall be done unto you, O false tongue? Sharp arrows of a warrior, with coals of juniper. With those who hate peace dwell I, who am for peace: when I speak of peace, they attack me without cause. Eternal rest grant them [those who have died], O Lord, and let perpetual light shine upon them.

(Psalm CXIX, 2-4, 6-7 for Vespers of the Office of the Dead)

CHORUS

THE PALESTINIAN UPRISING:

The need [is] for man to overcome oppression and violence without resorting to oppression and violence.

(Martin Luther King, Jr.)

WOODY ALLEN, A Stand Must be Taken:

Daniel Judge, reader

A LAMENT FOR THE REAL AS WELL AS A SYMBOLIC JERUSALEM:

This work, winner of the Barlow International Choral Composition competition in 1985, serves both as a comment on the tragic state of the current turmoil in Jerusalem and Israel as well as on our country's increasing isolation due to the world's distrust and diminishing respect for our international policies.

Planetus super inquitates hominem [excerpts]

L. D. Nuernberger (Written winter, 1985)

HERE BEGINS THE LAMENTATION OF JEREMIAH THE PROPHET:

ALEPH: How solitary she sits, the city once full of people! She is become as a widow! She that was great among the nations and princess among the provinces, how she is become under tribute!

BETH: She weeps bitterly in the night, and tears are on her cheeks: there is not one who consoles her out of all her ones. All her friends have betrayed her, and they have become her enemies.

GHIMEL: Judah has gone into exile because of oppression and because of great servirude. She dwells among the heathen; she finds no rest. All of her persecutors overtook her between the straits.

JERUSALEM, JERUSALEM, RETURN UNTO THE LORD, YOUR GOD. (Lamentations I, 1-3)

Suzanne Metz, Michèle Moede, Catherine Aragon, sopranos David Nowacek, tenor Carlo Maley, Ben Saferstein, basses

CHORUS
SACKBUT TRIO

MUSINGS OF A HISTORIAN'S GHOST:

THOMAS HARDY, Lausanne, In Gibbon's Old Garden: 11-12 p.m.:

Margaret Moore, reader

RECESSIONAL, A PSALM OF CAPTIVITY:

An Wasserflüssen Babylon

J. S. Bach (1685-1750)

[By the waters of Babylon, there we sat down, yea, we wept, when we remembered Zion. We hanged our harps upon the willows in the midst thereof. For there they that carried us away captive required of us a song; and they that wasted us required of us mirth, saying: Sing us one of the songs of Zion. How shall we sing the Lord's song in a strange land?]

(Psalm CXXXVII in the German of Paul Gerhardt)

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

EPILOGUE, A SONG OF HOPE:

Schütz composed his Psalm setting amidst the devastation of the Thirty Years War. His hope must have been then, as is ours now, that the world might yet return to peace and some more rational and higher order.

Speret Israel in Domino

Heinrich Schütz (1585-1672)

Let Israel hope in the Lord from henceforth and forever. (Psalm CXXXI, 3)

CHORUS

COLLEGIUM MUSICUM

L. D. Nuernberger, director
Ben Saferstein, assistant director

SINGERS

Catherine Aragon	Jennifer Kiernan
Jennifer Baker	Howard Leder
Greg Bloy	Jennifer Love
Ellen Bradburn	Carlo Maley
Rachel Clapham	Suzanne Metz
Anne Crawford	Michèle Moede
Peter Goehring	Margaret Moore
Michael Gallagher	David Nowacek
Katrina Grieve	Heather Parker
Kirsten Hagstrom	Paul V. Patanella
Tom Hallenbeck	Ben Saferstein
Daniel Judge	Alex Wolf

INSTRUMENTALISTS

Catherine Aragon, viols
Greg Bloy, recorders
Rachel Clapham, recorders
Anne Crawford, lute, rebec
Nathaniel Dickey, sackbut
Peter Goehring, hammer dulcimer
Tom Hallenbeck, viol
Robert Igo, recorders

Daniel Judge, recorders, krummborn
Suzanne Metz, viol
Margaret Moore, recorders
David Nowacek, cornetto
Ben Saferstein, lute, recorders, viols
Roger Schmidt, sackbut
Elizabeth Sharp, recorders
Nathan Wilkes, sackbut, krummborn