

OBERLIN COLLEGE CONSERVATORY OF MUSIC

## THE COLLEGIUM MUSICUM

*The Conflict of Heresy and Orthodoxy:  
A Brief Survey in Words and Music*



Urbanus Rhegius, *How to Recognize and Seize False Prophets*

*Beware of false prophets, which come to you in sheep's clothing,  
but inwardly they are ravening wolves.  
(Matthew VII, 15)*

FAIRCHILD CHAPEL

1985

4:30 P.M.

SATURDAY, DECEMBER 7

SUNDAY, DECEMBER 8

## PROLOGUE: IN SEARCH OF A DEFINITION OF HERESY

*Heresy is the lifeblood of religions.  
It is faith that begets heretics.  
There are no heretics in a dead religion.*  
(André Suàres, *Péguy*)

*It is the winners who write history—their way. . . . A heretic may be anyone whose outlook someone else dislikes or denounces. According to tradition, a heretic is one who deviates from the true faith. But what defines 'true faith'? Who calls it that, and for what reasons?*

(Elaine Pagels, *The Gnostic Gospels*)

### ONE VIEW:

Excerpt from Hilaire Belloc, *Heretics all*

Christopher Ertelt, *reader*

### A CONTRASTING VIEW:

From G. B. Shaw, Preface to *Saint Joan*

Shoshana Kaminsky, *reader*

### PROCESSIONAL: *Stat cultrix vigilans*

### Hymn for Joan of Arc

The caretaker of the gardens of the poor stands vigilant, thirteen years of age, knowing nothing, first taught in prayer then sharing piety—simple, gentle, and innocent.

While she listens to the voices above, she is fearful. But faithful to God, resolved to her fate, obedient to the command to free her country, she offers herself as an innocent sacrifice. Amen.

COLLEGIUM

## I. THE HERESY OF JOB:

*Job did not deny God or reject religion; but he was a heretic in as much as he could not accept the teaching of religion as final, and . . . he vindicated the right of all to seek God in their own way.*

(Francis Coutts, *The Heresy of Job*)

### DUALISTIC DOCTRINE—SATAN VS. GOD:

From Francis Coutts, *The Heresy of Job*

Anna Adler, *reader*

### FIRST TEST OF JOB:

From Job I, 8-12 and Job I, 13-19

Thomas Kangas, Sharon Carpenter, *readers*

*Job tonso capite*

[Job then shaved his head, fell down upon the ground and worshipped.]  
(Job I, 20)

Cristóbal de Morales  
(c. 1500-1553)

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

## SECOND TEST OF JOB:

From Job I, 22; II, 3-7

Jeanne Quinn, *reader*

### *Parce mihi, Domine*

Orlando di Lasso

(1532-1594)

Let me alone; for my days are vanity. What is man, that thou shouldest magnify him and that thou shouldest set thine ear upon him? And that thou shouldest visit him every moment? How long wilt thou not depart from me, nor let me alone till I swallow my spittle? (Job X, 1-7)

Paul Patanella, *baritone*

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

## JOB'S ORTHODOX COUNSEL:

From Job II, 11

Jonathan Brown, *reader*

## JOB REJECTS ORTHODOXY AND QUESTIONS GOD:

From Archibald Macleish, *J. B.*, Scene Nine

DRAMATIS PERSONAE

Jolly Adams: Amy Hansen  
Mrs. Murphy: Margaret Bernstein  
Mrs. Botticelli: Lisa Murray

Bildad: Christopher Ertelt  
Zophar: Ben Saferstein  
Eliphaz: Peter Goehring

J. B.: Paul Patanella

### *Taedet animam meam vitae meae*

Orlando di Lasso

My soul is weary of my life: I will leave my complaint upon myself; I will speak in the bitterness of my soul. I will say unto God: Do not condemn me.

### *Indica mihi, cur me ita judices!*

Show me wherefore thou contendest with me. Is it good unto thee that thou shouldest oppress, that thou shouldest despise the work of thine hands, and shine upon the counsel of the wicked? Hast thou eyes of flesh?—or seest thou as a man seest?

### *Numquid sicut dies hominis*

Are thy days as the days of man? Are thy years as man's days that thou enquirest after mine iniquities and searchest after my sin? Thou knowest that I am not wicked. And there is none that can deliver out of thine hand. (Job X, 1-7)

CHORUS

## GOD'S EXPLANATION:

Excerpt from Robert Frost, *A Masque of Reason*

DRAMATIS PERSONAE

God: David Luria

Job: Paul Patanella

## SUMMARY:

S. T. Coleridge, *Job's Luck*

Sally Ann Denmead, *reader*

## II. THE GNOSTIC AND ARIAN HERESIES

### THE ISSUE OF THE LOGOS

*The most important event which ever happened in the history of Christian dogma took place at the beginning of the second century . . . when Christian apologists laid down the equation: "The LOGOS is Jesus Christ."*

(Adolf Harnack, *The History of Dogma*)

*In principio erat verbum*

Josquin des Prez/Diego Pisador  
(c. 1509-c. 1560)

In the beginning was the Word, and the Word was God, and the Word was with God. The same was in the beginning with God. All things were made by him. (John I, 1-3)

Jeanne Quinn, *soprano*      Emilysue Pinnell, *alto*  
Ben Saferstein, *viuela*

### THE ORTHODOX POSITION:

From Tertullian, *The Demurrer against the Heretics* [3rd c.]

Adam Colson, *reader*

### THE ARIAN POSITION:

From Arius, *Encyclical Letters and Hodegas Fragment* [4th c.]

Lisa Murray, *reader*

*Das Wort ward Fleisch*

Heinrich Schütz  
(1585-1672)

And the Word was made flesh and dwelt among us, and we beheld his glory, the glory as of the only begotten of the Father, full of grace and truth. (John I, 14)

CHORUS

### CLEMENT'S DISSENT:

From Photius, *Against Clement of Alexandria* [4th c.]

Ben Neubauer, *reader*

### THE ISSUE OF APOSTOLIC SUCCESSION

*If the Lord Jesus Christ sent the Apostles to preach, no others ought to be received except those appointed by Christ. For no one knows the Father except the Son, and him to whom the Son gives a revelation. Nor does it seem that the Son has given revelation to any others than the Apostles.*

(Tertullian, *The Demurrer against the Heretics*)

### PETER AS SUCCESSOR:

*Tu es Petrus*

Cristóbal de Morales

You are Peter, and upon this rock I will build my church; and the gates of hell shall not prevail against it. Alleluia. (Matthew XVI, 18)

Sally Ann Denmead, *soprano*

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

### PAUL AS SUCCESSOR:

*But this I [Paul] confess unto thee, that after the way which they [the Jews] call heresy, so worship I the God of my fathers, believing all things that are written in the laws and in the prophets. (Acts XXIV, 13-15)*

*Tu es vas electionis*

Sebastián de Vivanco

(c. 1550-1622)

You are a chosen vessel, O holy apostle Paul, preacher of truth to the whole world.  
(cf. Acts IX, 15)

CHORUS

MARY MAGDELENE AS THE Gnostic SUCCESSOR:

*The Gnostic Gospel of Mary interprets the resurrection appearance as visions received in dreams or ecstatic trances. It recalls . . . that Mary Magdelene was [favored as] the first to see the risen Christ.*

(E. Pagals, *The Gnostic Gospels*)

*Christus resurgens*

Christopher Tye

(c. 1500-c. 1572)

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

*Maria Magdelene et altera Maria*

Francisco Guerrero

(1528-1599)

Mary Magdelene and the other Mary [the mother of James] brought spices that they might go and anoint Jesus; and in the early morning on the Sabbath they came to the sepulchre at the rising of the sun. Alleluia.

And entering into the sepulchre they saw a young man sitting on the right side, clothed in a long white robe. And they were frightened. He said to them: Jesus of Nazareth, whom you seek and who was crucified is risen. He is not here. Behold the place where they placed him. Alleluia. (Mark XVI, 1-7)

CHORUS

*Weib, was weinest du?*

Heinrich Schütz

Woman, why weepest thou? [Mary Magdelene saith:] Because they have taken away my Lord, and I know not where they have laid him. [Jesus saith unto her:] Mary! Mary! [She saith unto him:] Rabboni! [Jesus saith unto her:] Touch me not, for I am not yet ascended to my Father. I will ascend unto my Father and your Father. (John XX, 13; 16-17)

Beth Garfinkel, *soprano*      Karen Davis, *alto*  
Peter Goehring, *tenor*      Paul Patanella, *bass*

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

THE Gnostic POSITION:

*As Mary stands up to Peter so the Gnostics who take her as prototype challenge those priests and bishops who claim to be Peter's successors.*

(E. Pagals, *The Gnostic Gospels*)

From *Gospel of Mary I*, 17-19 [2nd. c.]

Karen Davis, *reader*

A REBUTTAL:

From Tertullian, *The Demurrer against the Heretics*

Peter Goehring, *reader*

THE ISSUE OF THE CREED

*The Apostle's Creed bears a most powerful testimony to the intensity of this struggle [with Gnosticism and Arianism]. The backbone of this creed was formed when the contest was still intense and it is plainly "a battle-creed." Almost every sentence bears the marks of the fight.*

(R. Jones, *The Church's Debt to Heretics*)

## A COMPOSITE CREED:

*Patrem omnipotentem* from *Mass*

Igor Stravinsky  
(1882-1971)

[Italics denote words contrary to Arian and/or Gnostic beliefs.]

[I believe] in God the Father Almighty, *Creator of heaven and earth* and of *all things visible and invisible*. And in *one Lord Jesus Christ*, the Son of God, the *Only-begotten, begotten of the Father before all ages*. Light of Light; *true God of true God, begotten, not made; OF THE SAME SUBSTANCE as the Father*; through whom *all things are made*; who for us men and for our salvation came down from heaven and took flesh of the Holy Spirit and of Mary the Virgin and WAS MADE MAN.

COLLEGIUM

*Crucifixus* from *Missa Assumpsit est Jesus*

Sebastián de Vivanco

He was crucified for us in the time of Pontius Pilate and suffered and was buried; and rose up on the third day, according to the Scriptures; and ascended into heaven, and is seated right of the Father, and will come again in glory to judge the living and the dead; of whose kingdom there will be no end.

Emilysue Pinnell, Shoshana Kaminsky, *sopranos*

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

*Et in unum Sanctum* from *Missa Tu es vas electionis*

Vivanco

And [I believe] in the Holy Spirit, *the Lord*, the Giver of life, who is *proceeding from the Father AND THE SON*, who together with the Father and the Son is *adored and glorified, who spoke through the prophets*. In one holy, CATHOLIC, and APOSTOLIC Church; we *confess one Baptism for the remission of sins*; and we await the resurrection of the dead and a life of the age to come. Amen.

CHORUS

## SUMMARY:

From G. B. Shaw, Preface to *Androcles and the Lion*

Beth Garfinkel, *reader*

## III. THE ALBIGENSIAN HERESY AND THE CRUSADE

*The twelfth century is one of the great ages of heresy; heresy which is a sure sign of intellectual vitality just as ideological uniformity is a sure sign of intellectual stagnation.*

*The Albigensians were the most radical, ascetic, and universal of all heretics . . . their doctrine came from Persia; it was the old Manichean dualism [cf. I. HERESY OF JOB] which had contended with Christianity in the 4th century and now returned.*

(Hugh Trevor-Roper, *The Rise of Christian Europe*)

*Mundus vergens*

Anonymous Conductus  
(French, c. 1210)

Declining into ruin, approving errors by its action, the world shows itself to be untrustworthy. For, as is patently obvious when the web of deceit is removed, it strives to destroy us by force or guile. And while it applies itself to these tasks it flaunts that which is transient. Flowering for so long in peace, the world is now kindled by the torch of war, and France perishes before its time. And now the ship, consigned to the sea, cut off from port and given up for lost, is tossed by storms. But battered by the turbulence, it does not lack guidance.

Jonathan Turner, Peter Goehring, *tenors*

Paul Patanella, Ben Saferstein, *basses*

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

## AT BÉZIERS

*Kill them all! Kill them all! God will recognize his own!*

(Arnold-Amaury, 13th-century abbot of Citeaux)

## THE MASSACRE:

From Pierre des Vaux-de-Cernay, *Historia Albigensis* [13th c.]

Thomas Hallenbeck, *reader*

### *Lament of Rachel from Slaughter of the Innocents*

Fleury Play-Book  
(13th century)

Alas! These tender youths, what mangled limbs we see!  
Alas! Sweet children! Murdered by madness alone!  
Alas! Whom neither pity nor age restrained!  
Alas! Wretched mothers, who are forced to see this!  
Alas! What shall we do now? Why not submit to these deeds?  
Alas! Because joys cannot lighten our sorrows!  
We cannot rejoice, for sweet children are wanting!

Sally Ann Denmead, *soprano*

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

## ON THE WALLS OF CARCASSONE

## DEFIANCE BY THE JONGLEURS:

From Robert Briffault, *The Troubadours*

Deborah Bilezikian, *reader*

### *Kalenda maya*

Raimbaut de Vaqueiras  
(c. 1160-c. 1205)

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

### *A l'entradre del tens clar*

Provençal Ballade  
(Late 12th century)

When the fine weather comes, EYA, to bring back joy again, EYA, and to annoy the  
jealous, EYA, I wish to show the Queen, for she is much in love. AWAY, AWAY, JEALOUS  
ONES, LEAVE US TO DANCE AMONG OURSELVES.

Beth Garfinkel, *soprano*

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

## CAPTURE BY TREACHERY:

From Robert Briffault, *The Troubadours*

Margaret Bernstein, *reader*

## THE SIEGE OF LAVAU

*The booty of Lavaur was the richest since the fall of Carcassone. As for the three or four  
hundred heretics found in the town, they were taken into a meadow before the wall and  
[according to Pierre des Vaux-de-Cernay] "there we burned them alive with joy in our  
hearts."*

(Jonathan Sumption, *The Albigensian Crusade*)

## FORMAT OF BURNINGS:

From Robert Briffault, *The Troubadours*; Pierre des Vaux-de-Cernay, *Historia Albigensis*

Jonathan Brown, Amy Hansen, *readers*

### *Veni Creator Spiritus—Pater noster*

CISTERCIANS: Come, Creator Spirit, visit the soul of Thy people and fill with grace from on high the hearts which Thou have created.

Thou who art called Paraclete, the gift of the most high God—fountain of life, fire, charity, and the heavenly anointed.

ALBIGENSIANS: Our Father, who art in heaven, hallowed be Thy name . . .

COLLEGIUM

## IV. HERESY AND THE REFORMATION

*Henry VIII established the Anglican VIA MEDIA (middle way) by burning heretics in pairs—Papists on one side and Anabaptists or Lutherans on the other.*

*(Columbia History of the World, edited by Garraty and Gay)*

*Let them show where I am a heretic, or dry up in their spittle . . . as they excommunicated me for the sacrilege of heresy, so I excommunicate them in the name of the sacred truth of God. Christ will judge whose excommunication will stand. Amen.*

*(Martin Luther, Against the Execrable Bull of Antichrist)*

### MARTYRDOM AT BRUSSELS:

From Walter Tillmanns, *The World and Men around Luther*

Emily Greenleaf, reader

#### *Ein neues Lied wir heben an*

Johann Walther  
(1496-1570)

We offer a new song, that our Lord God commands us to sing for what He has done, to His praise and honor, in Brussels in the Netherlands. Through two young boys well has He His miraculous power made known, and whom He with His gifts He had so richly adorned.

They lit two great fires and brought the lads out. Everyone marveled greatly that the lads scorned the fires. With joy they gave themselves to the fires while singing praise to God. The courage of the sophists failed because of this new thing which God Himself had caused to be observed. (Martin Luther)

Jonathan Brown, Peter Goehring, Ben Neubauer, *tenors*  
Anna Adler, Sharon Carpenter, Margaret Bernstein, *sopranos*

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

### A MELODY FOR OPPOSING FACTIONS:

*Erhalt uns, Herr, bei deinem Wort  
Bei deiner Kirch erhalt uns Herr*

Klugische Gesangbuch, 1543  
Leisentrit's *Geistliche Lieder*, 1567

A CHILDREN'S SONG TO SING AGAINST THE TWO ARCHENEMIES OF CHRIST  
AND HIS HOLY CHURCH—THE POPE AND THE TURK:

Preserve us, Lord, by Thy Word, and put an end to the murder by the Pope and the Turk, whom Jesus Christ, Thy Son, will overthrow from Thy throne. (Martin Luther)

A CHILDREN'S SONG TO SING AGAINST THE TWO ARCHENEMIES OF THE  
HOLY CATHOLIC CHRISTIAN CHURCH—THE HERETIC AND THE TURK:

Preserve us, Lord, through Thy Church. Protect us from all sectarian doctrine. Thy Church is alone indivisible; by Thy rock one knows it! (Catholic version)

Lisa Murray, Amy Hansen, Emily Greenleaf, *mezzo-sopranos*  
Thomas Hallenbeck, Christopher Ertelt, Jonathan Brown, *baritones*

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

## THE HERESY AT COURT: *Wiewohl viel berter Öder sind*

Ludwig Senfl  
(c. 1486-1543)

[Although there are many stringent monastic orders in which one finds many austere, spiritual men, I have observed none more dedicated than those who attend the prince's court day and night. The one who gives himself up to this wrangling and hangs on at court, places all his possessions in danger and remains imprisoned by fear.

Piety would struggle to be observed. Each one, who would waste his days at court, aspires far more that he revere his prince with service than the Lord God. A maxim is: Whoever gives himself up to remain a time at court must then foresake atonement and sign over his soul to the devil.]

INSTRUMENTAL ENSEMBLE

## RECESSIONAL: HUGUENOT PSALM *Deba contre mes debateurs*

Claude Goudimel  
(c. 1510-1572)

[Goudimel, a Huguenot, was killed in the St. Bartholomew's Day Massacre.]

Plead my cause, O Lord, with them that strive with me; fight against them that fight against me. Take hold of shield and buckler and stand up for mine help. Draw out also the spear, and stop the way against them that persecute me. Say unto my soul: I am thy salvation. Amen. (Psalm XXXV, 1-3)

COLLEGIUM

\* \* \* \* \*

## SYNOPSIS

The original meaning of "heretic" simply denoted one able to choose. In the formative years of Christianity, however, freedom of individual choice in matters of religious doctrine threatened to undermine the fragile stability and unity of the new Church. Thus, ironically, the same religion which had endured and survived the horrors of persecution by the Romans now gradually turned to persecution of dissenters within its own ranks. "Heretic" became a term of reproach, synonymous with falsity and anathema.

The Book of Job serves as an appropriate introduction to any study of heresy. The dualistic concept expressed therein, where God rules over heaven and things invisible while Satan prevails over the earth and things visible, was adopted as a fundamental tenet by many heretical sects. Job's heresy was his defiance in questioning God and his refusal to accept the counsel of his orthodox "comforters" that his suffering resulted from sin committed unknowingly.

Gnosticism implies "occult knowledge" imparted directly from God to the individual thus circumventing the necessity of the hierarchy of the orthodox Church. The numerous sects and forms which prevailed in the second century have been aptly termed the "Gnostic complex." Some Gnostics, challenging the *logos* concept, denied that Christ was ever human and maintained that his crucifixion and suffering were merely illusions. Others argued that Jesus was the "adopted" not "begotten" son of God. Although the epistles of Paul were acceptable and fundamental to the beliefs of most Gnostics, the preeminent position of Peter and Rome in the apostolic succession was challenged by those who held that the resurrected Christ appeared first to Mary Magdalene and that she was favored over all others. Arius was the principal heresiarch of the fourth century. He maintained that the Son was neither equal nor eternal with the Father. He

believed Jesus Christ a kind of demigod, neither quite human nor divine, of "similar" but not the "same substance" as the Father. The Nicene-Constantinopolitan Creed remains as much a refutation of Arian and dualistic tenets then current as it does an affirmation of faith. Our musical composite of settings of the Creed from portions of three different works symbolizes the diverse efforts of bishops and councils over some years that eventually finalized the language as we know it today.

Dualism resurged in Provence in the twelfth century. The Albigensians, many of whom were patrons of the Troubadours, did not recognize the authority of the Roman Church. Their rejection of orthodoxy coupled with their abundant wealth attracted the attention of the monarchy and nobility in northern France and precipitated the bloody Albigensian Crusade. The siege of Béziers, wherein identification of the innocent was left in the hands of God, was unprecedented in its reckless and random slaughter. Carcassone and its defiant inhabitants, including Troubadours, was next to fall as a result of treachery. Then Lavaur was conquered, its wealth confiscated, and its inhabitants led to the city wall and burned alive. We will reconstruct this last grisly scene in music with the Cistercians, who accompanied the crusaders in their conquests, singing a Pentecostal hymn to drown out the cries of the dying, who were reciting the Lord's Prayer to assure their eternal salvation.

The Reformation encouraged more overt expression by many sects—Anabaptists, Unitarians, Congregationalists among them—but the burnings and persecution persisted, mainly through the forces of the Inquisition. Luther's first hymn recounts in detail the martyrdom of two young Augustinian monks who were led to the fire at Brussels. The St. Bartholomew's Day massacre of the Huguenots in 1572 attests to the fury of dissention in France. But then one need only view Northern Ireland, Iraq and Iran, and Lebanon today to be reminded that religious differences are still capable of spawning the bloodiest consequences. The once heretical role of women as both priests and high officials in the Gnostic and Albigensian organizations has now resurfaced as a controversial issue within the modern Roman Church. Recently, a housewife was excommunicated from the Mormon Church for her participation in the ERA movement. The conflict of individual choice and organizational authority remains a constant and, perhaps, insoluble problem. One extreme leads to revolution and anarchy; the other, to total repression and loss of human dignity. Mutual tolerance, which would seem to provide the only hope of reconciliation, appears perpetually elusive in the course of human events.

## COLLEGIUM MUSICUM

L. D. Nuernberger, *director*

Paul V. Patanella, *assistant director*

### SINGERS

Anna Adler	Thomas Hallenbeck
Margaret Bernstein	Amy Hansen
Deborah Bilezikian	Thomas Kangas
Jonathan Brown	Shoshana Kaminsky
Sharon Carpenter	David Luria
Howard Chaffey	Lisa Murray
Adam Colson	Ben Neubauer
Karen Davis	Paul V. Patanella
Sally Ann Denmead	Emilysue Pinnell
Christopher P. Ertelt	Jeanne Ellen Quinn
Beth Garfinkel	Ben Saferstein
Peter Goehring	Claude Steinberg
Emily Greenleaf	Jonathan Turner

### INSTRUMENTALISTS

Margaret Bambach, <i>recorder</i>	Suzanne Kiihne, <i>recorder</i>
Rachel Clapham, <i>recorder</i>	Andrew Kinsey, <i>krummborn</i>
Jonathan Dawe, <i>krummborn</i>	Paul V. Patanella, <i>krummborn, sackbut, viola da gamba</i>
Elizabeth Eddins, <i>viola da gamba</i>	Jonathan Perry, <i>recorder</i>
Cameron Engel, <i>sackbut</i>	Emilysue Pinnell, <i>vielle</i>
Christopher P. Ertelt, <i>organ, portative</i>	Jeanne Ellen Quinn, <i>viola da gamba</i>
Beth Garfinkel, <i>recorder</i>	Ben Saferstein, <i>lute, vihuela</i>
Emily Greenleaf, <i>viola da gamba</i>	Karen Seif, <i>dulcian</i>
Robert P. Igo, <i>recorder</i>	Elizabeth Sharp, <i>recorder</i>
Daniel Judge, <i>krummborn, recorder</i>	Nathan Wilkes, <i>sackbut</i>

Special thanks to Elizabeth Eddins for her work with the gamba consort.